

RACISM AND DISCRIMINATION IN THE CONTEXT OF MIGRATION IN EUROPE

ENAR Shadow Report 2015-2016



european network against racism

Drafted by Ojeaku Nwabuzo, ENAR Senior Research Officer and Lisa Schaefer, ENAR Research Assistant, with significant contributions from the ENAR staff.

Copy editor: Georgina Siklossy, ENAR Senior Communication and Press Officer

Racism is a reality in the lives of many ethnic and religious minorities in the EU. However, the extent and manifestations of this reality are often unknown and undocumented, especially in official data sources, meaning that it can be difficult to analyse the situation and to establish solutions to it.

The ENAR Shadow Reports are produced to fill the gaps in the official and academic data, to offer an alternative to these data and to bring an NGO perspective on the realities of racism in the EU and its Member States. NGO reports are, by their nature, based on many sources of data, official, unofficial, academic and experiential. This allows access to information which, while sometimes not backed up by the rigours of academic standards, provides the vital perspective of those that either are or work directly with those affected by racism. It is this that gives NGO reports their added value, complementing academic and official reporting.

Published by the European Network Against Racism (ENAR) in Brussels, in 2016, with the support of the Rights, Equality and Citizenship Programme of the European Union, the Open Society Foundations and the ENAR Foundation.



OPEN SOCIETY
FOUNDATIONS



The contents of this publication can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Commission or of the Open Society Foundations.

ENAR reserves the right not to be responsible for the accuracy, completeness or quality of the information provided in this report. Liability claims regarding damage caused by the use of any information provided, including any information which is incomplete or incorrect, will therefore be rejected.

Design and layout: Crossmark

ENAR – European Network Against Racism aisbl
67 Rue Ducale, B-1000 Brussels
Tel +32 2 229 35 70
Email: info@enar-eu.org
www.enar-eu.org

4. RACIST CRIME AND ACCESS TO JUSTICE

4.1 Racially motivated crimes against migrants

Racist attacks against migrants, asylum seekers, refugees and their accommodation in EU Member States, fuelled by the terrorist attacks in Europe and an increasingly hateful anti-migrant political and public discourse, were reported by civil society organisations, media and international organisations across the European Union. There is also evidence that the incidents recorded in the media or official statistics are only the tip of the iceberg as most of them go unreported.

Lack of official data

While there is a general lack of official data collected by police and state authorities on racially motivated crime in Europe,¹³³ the official data available on racially motivated crimes against migrants, asylum seekers, refugees and their accommodation are even scarcer. In some countries civil society organisations publish data on racist attacks against migrants. Where data exist, the data collection and recording is not consistent and varies in terms of categories and terminology. There is no cross-reference across categories such as ethnic or religious background which makes it difficult to assess the impact of racist crimes on in particular ethnic and religious minorities within the migrant population.

Table 8 includes figures that were collected by police or state authorities (indicated as official data) and civil society organisations in 2015/16. This was the case for only eight Member States: Austria, Cyprus, Czech Republic, Finland,

Germany, Greece, Ireland, and Sweden. This illustrates the significant gaps in monitoring of racist attacks targeting migrants.

State authorities in Austria, Germany and Finland published figures on attacks on asylum seekers' and refugees' accommodation. In **Finland**, the Interior Ministry reported 47 attacks against reception centres in 2015. In **Germany**, the Federal Criminal Police Office published data on "right-wing motivated crimes", including a subcategory of crimes 'targeting asylum accommodation' since 2014. 1031 right-wing motivated crimes targeting asylum accommodation were registered in 2015 and 988 in 2016, a massive increase up from 199 crimes in 2014 in the same category. According to data gathered by civil society organisations Amadeu Antonio Stiftung and Pro Asyl, there was a total of 3729 attacks against refugees and asylum seekers in 2016.¹⁴¹

133 Nwabuzo, Ojeaku. *Racist Crime in Europe ENAR Shadow Report 2013 - 2014 2014/15*. 2015. Brussels: European Network Against Racism. Available at: http://www.enar-eu.org/IMG/pdf/shadowreport_2013-14_en_final_lowres-2.pdf.

134 Austrian Ministry of Interior 2016. Available at: http://medienservicestelle.at/migration_bewegt/2016/11/22/1-halbjahr-2016-24-anschlaege-auf-asyleinrichtungen/. Figures for 2016 refer to the first six months of 2016.

135 The five racial incidents reported by non-Cypriots included reports from one Bulgarian, one Greek, and one Syrian. In two cases the nationality was unspecified. Office for Combating Discrimination in Cyprus 2016. Available at: http://www.police.gov.cy/police/police.nsf/dmlstatistical_en/dmlstatistical_en?OpenDocument.

136 European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. *Current Migration Situation in the EU: Hate Crime November 2016*. 2016. Available at: http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/fra-2016-november-monthly-focus-hate-crime_en.pdf.

137 German Federal Criminal Police Office 2016. Available at: <https://www.ta-gesschau.de/inland/bka-asylunterkuenfte-103.html>.

138 Racist Violence Recording Network. *Racist Violence Recording Network 2015 Annual Report*. 2016. Available at: http://rvrn.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/04/Report_2015eng.pdf.

139 ENAR Ireland. *iReport.ie Reports of Racism in Ireland*. Available at: <http://enarireland.org/ireport-quarterly/>.

140 OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights. *Hate Crime Reporting*. Available at: <http://hatecrime.osce.org/sweden>.

141 See <http://mut-gegen-rechte-gewalt.de/service/chronik-vorfaelle>.

Table 8: Racist attacks targeting migrants, asylum seekers, refugees and/or their accommodation

Member States	Type of attack	Official data	2015	2016
Austria ¹³⁴	Attacks against asylum seekers' accommodation	Yes	25	24
Cyprus ¹³⁵	Racially motivated violent incidents reported by non-Cypriots	Yes	5	n.a.
Finland	Attacks against reception centres ¹³⁶	No	47	n.a.
Germany ¹³⁷	Right-wing motivated crimes targeting asylum accommodation	Yes	1031	988
	Acts of violence against asylum seekers and refugees	Yes	n.a.	2545
Greece ¹³⁸	Racist incidents targeting immigrants and refugees	No	75	n.a.
Ireland ¹³⁹	Racist incidents targeting 'foreigners' and refugees	No	9	34
Sweden ¹⁴⁰	Arson attacks against asylum seekers' accommodation	No	43	n.a.

In Austria, the Czech Republic, Germany, Greece, Ireland and Sweden civil society organisations publish data on racist attacks against migrants and/or asylum seekers' and refugees' accommodation. The Kantor Centre, a think tank on Antisemitism and racism, recorded 43 arson attacks on asylum centres in **Sweden** in 2015.¹⁴² In **Greece**, the Racist Violence Recording Network – a civil society coalition set up by the UNHCR, the National Commission for Human Rights and NGOs working with victims of racist violence – reported 75 racist incidents targeting immigrants and refugees in 2015 “due to their national or ethnic origin, religion or colour”, which represents a 60% increase compared to 2014.¹⁴³ In **Ireland**, iReport, an online reporting system set up by ENAR Ireland, recorded 9 racist incidents targeting migrants, including ‘foreigners’ (5) and refugees (4) between June and December 2015, while 2 of the 4 attacks against refugees specifically targeted Syrian refugees. Between January and June 2016, iReport recorded racist incidents targeting visa-holders (13), asylum seekers (1) and refugees (1).¹⁴⁴ According to iReport, the low number of incidents reported by asylum seekers and refugees can be explained by a tendency of these groups to underreport. This issue is further discussed in the section on underreporting of racist crimes against migrants.

The **United Kingdom** witnessed a huge spike in reported hate crimes after Britain’s vote to leave the European Union which was at least partly linked to the campaign around the referendum. Monitoring by the London mayor’s evidence and insight team showed a 16% increase in hate crime in the 12 months to August. It also showed that in the 38 days after the referendum there were more than 2,300 recorded racist offences in London, compared with 1,400 in the 38 days before the vote.¹⁴⁵

It is important to note that the quantitative figures presented here can only be seen as the tip of the iceberg. Reports by civil society organisations, media

EU Framework Decision on combating racism and xenophobia

The EU Framework Decision 2008/913/JHA aims to combat certain forms and expressions of racism and xenophobia through a common EU-wide criminal law. The Framework decision defines two types of offences: racist and xenophobic hate speech and hate crime. It requires EU Member States to specifically address public incitement to violence or hatred directed against a person or persons belonging to a group defined by reference to race, colour, religion, descent or national or ethnic origin in their criminal codes or to take racist motivation into account as an aggravating circumstance.

and international organisations show that racist attacks on migrants, asylum seekers, refugees and their accommodations are pervasive in Europe, as also observed by a 2016 FRA report on the current migration situation with a focus on hate crime.¹⁴⁶ In **Denmark**, the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) reported the case of an asylum seeker who was severely assaulted by a group of masked men, an arson attack on a bus used by the inhabitants of an asylum centre, and three incidents in which threatening graffiti were sprayed on asylum centres’ walls.¹⁴⁷ In **Hungary**, the UNHCR and the Hungarian Helsinki Committee reported several physical assaults targeting Nigerians and other refugees.¹⁴⁸ Racist attacks against Muslim migrants were reported by media and civil society organisations. In **Romania**, for instance, two Syrian women were physically assaulted on the streets of Bucharest by five unidentified teenagers for wearing the hijab in March 2016.¹⁴⁹ In the **United Kingdom**, a student from Poland was stabbed in the neck with a smashed bottle “because he was speaking Polish” in September 2016.¹⁵⁰

142 OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights. *Hate Crime Reporting*. Available at: <http://hatecrime.osce.org/sweden>.

143 Racist Violence Recording Network. *Racist Violence Recording Network 2015 Annual Report*. 2016. Available at: http://rvrn.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/04/Report_2015eng.pdf.

144 ENAR Ireland. *iReport.ie Reports of Racism in Ireland*. Available at: <http://enarireland.org/i-report-quarterly/>.

145 Weaver, Matthew. “Horrible Spike” in Hate Crime Linked to Brexit Vote, Met Police Say. *The Guardian*. 28 September 2016. Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/society/2016/sep/28/hate-crime-horrible-spike-brexit-vote-metropolitan-police>.

146 European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. *Current Migration Situation in the EU: Hate Crime* November 2016. 2016.

147 OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights. *Hate Crime Reporting*. Available at: <http://hatecrime.osce.org/denmark>

148 OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights. *Hate Crime Reporting*. Available at: <http://hatecrime.osce.org/hungary>

149 ‘Ancheta dupa agresarea in capitala doua tinere din Siria’. *Digi 24*. 1 April 2016. Available at: <http://www.digi24.ro/stiri/actualitate/justitie/ancheta-dupa-agresarea-in-capitala-a-doua-tinere-din-siria-502387> accessed on 13/09/2016. As cited in the Romania Shadow Report questionnaire response.

150 Dearden, Lizzie. ‘UK Student Stabbed in Neck for Speaking Polish Describes Brutal Post-Brexit Assault in Telford’. *The Independent*. 20 September 2016. Available at: <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/crime/uk-student-stabbed-in-neck-for-speaking-polish-brutal-post-brexit-assault-telford-donnington-park-a7319181.html>.

Due to the scarce data available, it is difficult to draw general conclusions about which migrant groups are specifically targeted by racist crimes. However, it is clear from the research that asylum seekers and refugees, and in particular those living in collective accommodation, are vulnerable and exposed to racist crimes. The available figures and reports suggest that racialised migrants e.g. from African countries (**Spain**) and more specifically from Somalia (**Finland**) or with certain ethnic/religious minority backgrounds, e.g. Arabs (**Poland**) and Muslim migrants (**Romania**) are amongst the most targeted migrant groups. In **Ireland**, it is reported that racist crimes were specifically directed against Syrian refugees. Violent acts against migrants from eastern European countries were in particular reported in the **United Kingdom**. A survey of EU embassies in London revealed that the majority of suspected hate crime reported to them since the UK vote to leave the EU, involved citizens from eastern European countries and in particular Polish citizens.¹⁵¹

Types of reported crimes

Racist attacks on migrants included a variety of offences ranging from incitement to hatred/threats, to (arson) attacks on asylum seekers' and refugees' accommodation to physical assault (including murder).

Cases of hate speech and incitement to hatred against migrants were reported in all the EU Member States covered in this report. In **Slovenia**, Spletno oko, an internet-based contact point coordinated by the Faculty of Social Sciences of the University of Ljubljana, reported 51 cases of hate speech to the police in 2015, and in 55% of these cases the hate speech incidents targeted refugees.¹⁵² Researchers in Austria, Italy, Germany, the Czech Republic and Estonia pointed explicitly at online incitement to hatred targeting migrants and the spread of fake news. In **Italy**, for instance, websites such as "*I crimini degli immigrati*" ("crimes of immigrants") spread false information about alleged crimes committed by migrants

with a distinct racist component.¹⁵³ As already discussed in Section 2 of this report, these incidents are rarely monitored, let alone regulated, while further fuelling anti-migrant hatred and thus contributing to an increasingly violent and hostile atmosphere towards migrants.

Physical assaults on migrants, asylum seekers and refugees were reported by media and civil society across all Member States included in this report. In **Poland**, a Syrian refugee was racially insulted and severely beaten by three men in Poznan on 3 November 2015.¹⁵⁴ In February 2016 the first attacker was sentenced to two years imprisonment and the second attacker was sentenced to three months imprisonment and one year of community work.¹⁵⁵ In **Sweden**, a group of black-clad and masked people physically assaulted people who looked 'foreign' in Stockholm on 29 January 2016.¹⁵⁶ In **Malta**, a French man filed a police report against four nightclub doormen who beat him while making racist comments such as "Go back to Africa, faggot" and "Don't come back again, you piece of black shit".¹⁵⁷

Physical assaults included excessive use of force, sometimes going as far as murder. In **Italy**, a Nigerian asylum seeker and his wife were racially insulted. When he reacted to racist insults addressed to his wife, he was beaten by a man with an iron pole and killed.¹⁵⁸ In the **United Kingdom**, a Polish migrant died after being attacked by several teenagers in Harlow, Essex in August 2016.¹⁵⁹

151 Weaver, Matthew & Laville Sandra. 'European Embassies in UK Log More Alleged Hate Crimes Since Brexit Vote'. *The Guardian*. 19 September 2016. Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/society/2016/sep/19/embassies-alleged-hate-crimes-since-brexit-vot>.

152 Center za varnejši internet, prijavna točka Spletno oko, Letno poročilo Spletno oko 2015, Fakulteta za družbene vede, Center za varnejši internet, Spletno oko, Ljubljana (2016:7). Available at: http://safe.si/sites/safe.si/files/spletno_oko_-_letno_porocilo_2015.pdf. As cited in the Slovenia Shadow Report questionnaire response.

153 IDOS (2015) Dossier Statistico Immigrazione. Dal contagio "virale" al web-marketing dell'odio razzista (Andrisani Paola), 250-252. As cited in the Italy Shadow Report questionnaire response.

154 Ojewska, Natalia. 'A "Witch-hunt" for Poland's Barely Visible Refugees'. *Al Jazeera*. 3 December 2015. Available at: <http://www.aljazeera.com/in-depth/features/2015/12/witch-hunt-poland-barely-visible-refugees-151201111826928.html>.

155 Piotr Żytnicki, Pobili Syryjczyka w centrum Poznania. Sąd ogłosił wyrok. Available at: <http://poznan.wyborcza.pl/poznan/1,36037,19694952,pobili-syryjczyka-w-centrum-poznania-sad-oglosil-wyrok.html>. As cited in the Poland Shadow Report questionnaire response.

156 O. Forsberg, R. Aschberg, S. Hagberg, S. Dickson, K. Ahlborg, 'Stort polispådrag i Centrala Stockholm'. *Aftonbladet*. 29 January 2016. Available at: <http://www.aftonbladet.se/nyheter/article22175101.ab>. As cited in the Sweden Shadow Report questionnaire response.

157 'French Youth "Suffers Violent Racist Attack" by Paceville Bouncers'. *Malta Today Online*. 26 February 2016. Available at: http://www.maltatoday.com.mt/news/national/62631/french_youth_suffers_violent_racist_attack_by_paceville_bouncers_#V7bJyKKo0kF. As cited in the Malta Shadow Report questionnaire response.

158 <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-36733575>.

159 Quinn, Ben. 'Six Teenage Boys Arrested Over Death of Polish Man in Essex'. *The Guardian*. 30 August 2016. Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2016/aug/30/five-teenage-boys-arrested-after-man-dies-following-attack-in-essex>.

Austria, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Italy and Sweden reported violent attacks against asylum seekers' and refugees' accommodation including accommodation for unaccompanied minors.¹⁶⁰ The attacks manifested themselves in various forms such as racist graffiti, damage (e.g. throwing stones at windows), gun shots as well as acid and arson attacks. In **Sweden**, 12 arson attacks were directed at asylum centres for unaccompanied children between March and December 2015. In **Germany**, perpetrators poured acid into an asylum seekers' centre in Flensburg in February 2016, injuring two men from Syria.¹⁶¹ Finland,¹⁶² Germany¹⁶³ and France reported arson attacks on empty asylum accommodation which aimed to prevent asylum seekers from moving in. In **France**, a migrant reception centre was set ablaze in October 2016, one day before migrants were supposed to be accommodated there after the dismantling of the camp in Calais.¹⁶⁴

As a 2015 report on Islamophobia in Europe states, the 'refugee crisis' became increasingly linked to the perception of Muslims 'invading' and 'endangering' Europe.¹⁶⁵ This manifested itself, amongst others, in violent acts against Muslim migrants and religious institutions. Austria, Belgium, Cyprus, the Czech Republic, France, Germany, Greece, Poland, Romania, Spain Sweden and the United Kingdom reported (arson) attacks against mosques and/or Muslim community centres.¹⁶⁶ Two explosives detonated outside the doors of a mosque and a congress centre in Dresden, **Germany** in September

2016.¹⁶⁷ The suspect was affiliated with the anti-migrant and Islamophobic Pegida movement.¹⁶⁸ In France, people fired gunshots at a mosque in Carpentras in June 2015. In **Slovenia**, unknown perpetrator(s) put pigs' heads and pig's blood on the construction site of a mosque and at the Islamic Cultural Centre in Ljubljana in January 2016.¹⁶⁹

Human rights activists and politicians expressing support for asylum seekers and refugees have increasingly become targets of violent attacks. In **Slovenia**, the National House in Novo mesto, hosting local artists who collect humanitarian aid for refugees, was repeatedly attacked by local neo-Nazis between November 2015 and February 2016. Perpetrators sprayed a Celtic cross and a swastika on the walls of the building, and threw Molotov cocktails on one occasion.¹⁷⁰ In **Bulgaria**, the Chair of the human rights organisation Bulgarian Helsinki Committee was attacked by unknown men in Sofia.¹⁷¹ In the **Czech Republic**, several organisations which joined a governmental "HateFree Culture" campaign were attacked (right-wing extremist slogans, broken windows) in April 2016.¹⁷² In **Germany**, authorities recorded more than 450 asylum-related assaults on politicians and aid workers in 2016.¹⁷³

Perpetrators

Racist attacks on migrants, asylum seekers and refugees involve a variety of perpetrators. However, many attacks, in particular those on accommodation, remain unsolved. In **Germany**, journalists from the Newspaper *Die Zeit* investigated 222 attacks on asylum accommodation centres

160 Shadow Report questionnaire responses and information reported to OSCE/ODIHR: <http://hatecrime.osce.org/>.

161 'Chemie-Anschlag auf Flensburger Flüchtlingsheim'. *Flensburger Tageblatt*. 23 February 2016. Available at: <http://www.shz.de/lokales/flensburger-tageblatt/chemie-anschlag-auf-flensburger-fluechtlingsheim-id12822001.html>.

162 'Arson Attack Attempted on Planned Refugee Centre in Turku'. *Finland Times*. 26 October 2015. Available at: <http://www.finlandtimes.fi/national/2015/12/26/23624/Arson-attack-attempted-on-planned-refugee-centre-in-turku>.

163 Gmund Schwabisch. 'Refugees in Germany: Arsonists Destroy Refugee Hotel in 'Model' Migrant Town'. *Independent*. 3 January 2016. Available at: <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/refugees-in-germany-arsonists-destroy-refugee-hotel-in-model-migrant-town-schwabisch-gmund-a6794891.html>.

164 Moccozet, Stéphane. 'Le Centre d'Accueil Destiné aux Migrants Incendié'. *France Info*. 24 October 2016. Available at: <http://france3-regions.francetvinfo.fr/auvergne-rhone-alpes/puy-de-dome/loubeyrat-63-centre-accueil-migrants-incendies-1115325.html>.

165 Bayrakli, Enes and Hafez, Farid (eds). *European Islamophobia Report 2015*. 2016. Available at: http://www.islamophobiaeurope.com/reports/2015/en/EIR_2015.pdf.

166 Shadow Report questionnaire responses and information reported to OSCE/ODIHR: <http://hatecrime.osce.org/>.

167 MDR Sachsen. *Sprengstoffanschläge auf Moschee und Kongresszentrum in Dresden*. Available at: <http://www.mdr.de/sachsen/dresden/sprengstoff-anschlaege-in-dresden-100.html>

168 'Tatverdächtiger trat als Redner bei Pegida-Demo auf'. *Zeit Online*. 9 December 2016. Available at: <http://www.zeit.de/gesellschaft/zeitgeschehen/2016-12/dresden-anschlag-moschee-polizei-festnahme-tatverdaechtiger>.

169 <http://www.islamska-skupnost.si/novice/2016/01/reporterjevo-hujskanje-in-svinjske-glave/>; http://www.vlada.si/medijsko_sredisce/sporocila_za_javnost/sporocilo_za_javnost/article/vlada_kljucna_sta_strpnost_in_spostovanje_razlicnosti_57371/. As cited in the Slovenia Shadow Report questionnaire response.

170 <http://www.mladina.si/172372/nestrpnezni-znova-nad-novomeski-sokolski-dom/>; <http://www.mladina.si/171695/na-vrata-novomeskega-sokolskega-doma-neznanec-odvrgel-molotovko/>. As cited in the Slovenia Shadow Report questionnaire response.

171 European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. *Current Migration Situation in the EU: Hate Crime November 2016*. 2016.

172 'Graffiti in Prague Probably Motivated by Hate'. *Czech News Agency (ČTK)*. 26 April 2016. Available at: <http://www.praguemonitor.com/2016/04/26/graffitis-prague-probably-motivated-hate>. As cited in the Czech Republic Shadow Report questionnaire response.

173 'Hundreds of Right-wing Asylum-related Attacks in 2016'. *Deutsche Welle*. 13 November 2016. Available at: <http://www.dw.com/en/hundreds-of-right-wing-asylum-related-attacks-in-2016/a-36377046>.

in 2015 and found that in only four cases courts convicted perpetrators and in eight cases charges were pressed. This represents only 5% of all attacks. The police found suspects in less than a quarter of all attacks.¹⁷⁴ In cases where perpetrators were identified, there is a scarce recording of their political affiliation. As indicated in the 2013/14 Shadow Report on Racist Crime in Europe, the exact political orientation of the perpetrators remains unknown.

Nevertheless, racist crimes involving perpetrators affiliated to far-right movements were reported in several Member States. In **Italy**, far-right movements such as Forza Nuova were reported to be involved in attacks on reception centres for asylum seekers in Treviso, Northern Italy, in 2015.¹⁷⁵ In **Sweden**, the far-right organisation Nordic Youth carried out an attack on refugee accommodation in Arboga in August 2015.¹⁷⁶ In 2016, Germany's domestic intelligence agency even warned of emerging "right-wing terrorist structures" due to a sharp rise in far-right violence targeting migrants, asylum seekers and their accommodation.¹⁷⁷ In **Germany**, eight members of the "Group Freital" were charged with forming a far-right terrorist organisation and being responsible for five racist attacks on refugees and their accommodation, including the use of bombs and explosives.¹⁷⁸ In addition, a 2016 study by the University of Leipzig indicated that those with far-right views are more willing to act violently upon them.¹⁷⁹

However, despite these tendencies, further evidence from Member States suggests that racist attacks on migrants and asylum seekers are not only committed by individuals or groups directly related to far-right movements. Civil society organisations in Italy, Poland and Portugal pointed to the impact of the far-right movements' anti-

migrant and Islamophobic rhetoric and the numerous anti-migrant protests and demonstrations across Europe, which legitimises violent attacks, emboldens people with racist views to take action and contributes to an overall climate of hostility towards migrants. In Belgium, the Czech Republic, Germany and Poland, for instance, it was reported that people felt encouraged by a growing anti-migrant sentiment and were less afraid to carry out violent attacks. In **Greece**, local communities and residents, in particular on the Greek islands, became increasingly involved in violent protests. In February 2016, the construction of a major migrant reception and registration centre on the Greek island of Kos sparked violent protests by local residents.¹⁸⁰

This overall climate is also exemplified by the creation of new vigilante groups linked to far-right ideology or an increased activity of those that already existed. This phenomenon is reported in Austria, Bulgaria, Denmark, Finland, Germany, Hungary, Poland and Sweden. In **Sweden**, Soldiers of Odin, a neo-Nazi group founded in Finland, was established in February 2016 to protect the streets from the threat they claim is posed by newly arrived migrants. Since then, more than 20 local organisations have been established, and the network has been engaged in patrolling the streets in different cities. Local vigilante groups such as "Shipka" (Bulgarian national movement) or "Vasil Levski" (Bulgarian Military Union) in **Bulgaria** and "Hunyadi Border-Guard Unit" in **Hungary** have started patrolling and apprehending migrants at the borders. In Bulgaria, members of these vigilante groups are reported to racially abuse and mistreat these migrants.¹⁸¹

Underreporting of racist crimes targeting migrants

As highlighted in the 2013/2014 ENAR Shadow Report on Racist crime in Europe, a huge proportion of racist crimes goes unreported. Main reasons for non-reporting are a lack of trust in the police, a lack of confidence in the impact of reporting, fear of discrimination, fear of repeat victimisation, lack of victim support services and lack of awareness of victims' rights. However, for migrants and in particular for

174 'Es brennt in Deutschland'. *Zeit Online*. 3 December 2015. Available at: <http://www.zeit.de/politik/deutschland/2015-11/rechtsextremismus-fluechtlingsunterkuenfte-gewalt-gegen-fluechtlinge-justiz-taeter-urteile>.

175 'La rivolta di Treviso contro i profughi. Roghi e scontri: "Via i neri da qui!'. *Repubblica*. 17 July 2015. Available at: http://www.repubblica.it/cronaca/2015/07/17/news/la_rivolta_di_treviso_contro_i_profughi_roghi_e_scontri_via_i_neri_da_qui_-119252034/?rss. As cited in the Italy Shadow Report questionnaire response.

176 Poohl, D. *Ökad radikalisering – Increased Radicalisation*. Expo. Available at: <http://expo.se/hatetspolitik/okat-politiskt-vald/>. As cited in the Sweden Shadow Report questionnaire response.

177 'Germany Sees Rise In Far-Right Violence, Warns Of Terrorist Structures'. *Huffington Post*. 28 June 2016. Available at: http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/right-wing-terrorist-structures-in-germany_us_5772955fe4b0f168323afa98.

178 'Far-right Freital Terrorist Group Charged'. *Deutsche Welle*. 15 November 2016. Available at: <http://www.dw.com/en/far-right-freital-terrorist-group-charged/a-36405586>.

179 Horst, Kahrs. *Die enthemmte Mitte – Zusammenfassung ausgewählter Ergebnisse*. 2016. Available at: http://www.rosalux.de/fileadmin/rls_uploads/pdfs/Studien/Zusammenfassung_Mittestudie.pdf.

180 'Violent Protests Against Migrant Center'. *Deutsche Welle*. 16 February 2016. Available at: <http://www.dw.com/en/violent-protests-against-migrant-center/av-19050921>.

181 Germanova, Miroslava, Dzhambazova, Boryana and Bienvenu, Helen. 'Vigilantes Patrol Parts of Europe Where Few Migrants Set Foot'. *The New York Times*. 10 June 2016. Available at: https://www.nytimes.com/2016/06/11/world/europe/vigilante-patrols-in-parts-of-europe-where-few-migrants-set-foot.html?_r=0.

undocumented migrants, asylum seekers and refugees, there are further reasons for non-reporting of racist crimes.

In Cyprus, Germany, Poland, Portugal and Spain, undocumented migrants were reluctant to report crimes for fear of arrest and expulsion due to their irregular status.¹⁸² Safe reporting is not ensured in every EU Member State. In **Portugal**, there is a legal obligation to notify the border guard when an undocumented migrant reports to the police. **Spain** still requires showing an ID/residence permit when reporting a crime.¹⁸³ Some cases were reported where undocumented victims of racist crime were detained or faced consequences with regard to their residence permit in the process of reporting a hate crime. In **Greece**, two Pakistani nationals filed a lawsuit in Aspropyrgos police department following a racist attack against them. After the complaint was filed, the police announced that the complainants would be kept in administrative detention because they did not have legal documents. They were released only after the plaintiffs' lawyer intervened.¹⁸⁴ In **Cyprus**, a migrant from Pakistan married to a Bulgarian woman reported a case of telephone harassment to the police and got his residence permit revoked as authorities decided that this was a "marriage of convenience".¹⁸⁵

Victim support and civil society organisations in **Greece, Germany and Latvia** also reported a general 'fear of deportation' amongst migrants. Asylum seekers, for instance, were reported to be afraid of reporting crime to the police because they fear negative consequences for their asylum process. Civil society organisations in **Ireland** reported an overall perception amongst migrants that they "should not cause problems", while fearing that reporting a crime could lead to be considered as a "troublemaker" which in turn could result in "being further discriminated".¹⁸⁶

While a lack of trust in police and government officials is a reason for non-reporting of racist crimes, in **Italy** and **Cyprus** this is particularly the case for newly arrived asylum seekers and refugees, as many of them might

have experienced abuse and violence by police and government officials on their way to Europe, in their country of origin and possibly in Europe. There is a common perception among migrants that police will not handle the reported crimes seriously.

In **Greece**, civil society organisations reported that a major reason for non-reporting arises from the fact that many migrants want to leave Greece as soon as possible and are reluctant to start a long administrative or legal procedure with an unclear outcome.¹⁸⁷

In most Member States covered in this report, it is reported that in particular for newly arrived migrants, lack of language knowledge, lack of awareness of their rights as victims and lack of practical knowledge about where to file a complaint are further crucial reasons for non-reporting.

4.2 Victim support and access to justice

Undocumented migrants in particular face significant challenges in accessing justice. Victim support services for migrants can provide much needed practical support and (legal) advice. Access to such services is guaranteed through the 2012 EU Victims' Directive.

EU Victims' Directive

The EU Victims' Directive was adopted in 2012 and establishes minimum standards on the rights, support and protection of all victims of crime, irrespective of their residence status. It ensures that victims are recognised and treated with respect and dignity and are protected from further victimisation. The Directive emphasises the victims' right to be informed in a way they understand, and to make a complaint in a language they understand and ensures victims' access to free, confidential support services and protection measures. It also requires that the Member States ensure appropriate training on victims' needs for officials who are likely to come into contact with victims.¹⁸⁸

182 Shadow Report questionnaire responses.

183 PICUM. *EU Victims' Directive Transposition Checklist*. Available at: http://picum.org/uploads/publication/chart_countries_Full_MGM_Nov2014.pdf.

184 Greece Shadow Report questionnaire response.

185 Cyprus Shadow Report questionnaire response.

186 Ireland Shadow Report questionnaire response.

187 Racist Violence Recording Network. *Racist Violence Recording Network 2015 Annual Report*. 2016. Available at: http://rvrn.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/04/Report_2015eng.pdf.

188 See http://ec.europa.eu/justice/criminal/victims/index_en.htm.

The EU Victims' Directive addresses crucial factors that lead to underreporting of racist crimes and can be a useful tool to improve migrants' access to justice, in particular as the Directive recognises the particular vulnerability of hate crime victims. Member States were given until 16 November 2015 to transpose the Directive into national law. However, several NGOs and researchers have highlighted gaps in the actual implementation process, stating that it is still difficult for asylum seekers, refugees and in particular undocumented migrants to claim their rights as a hate crime victim. **Croatia, Greece and Ireland** explicitly reported that the EU Victim's Directive has not yet been transposed into national law.¹⁸⁹ In November 2017, the Commission will publish an implementation report, indicating the state of transposition in all participating states.

As discussed above, safe reporting without fear of consequences due to an irregular or insecure residence status is not guaranteed in all Member States. This is why for instance PICUM, the Platform for International Cooperation on Undocumented Migrants, advocates for the establishment of a so-called 'firewall' principle that ensures that undocumented migrants can report crimes and abuse to the police without fearing that authorities will be notified about their irregular status. The opportunity to report anonymously or to report via intermediary organisations plays a crucial role in this respect.

Access to free legal aid is key to migrants' access to justice as it is crucial for bringing cases to court and to participate in criminal proceedings. Article 13 of the EU Victims' Directive states that Member States shall ensure victims' access to legal aid, where they have the status of parties to criminal proceedings. The conditions or procedural rules under which victims have access to legal aid, however, are to be determined by national law.

Victim support services

Victim support services offer services such as legal aid, victim protection, health or psychological counselling and are provided by various institutions such as state authorities and NGOs. However, as the ENAR Shadow Report on Racist Crime as well as the EU Fundamental Rights Agency have already shown, victim support services

for hate crime victims are not sufficiently developed in EU Member States. Existing support is highly fragmented due to the variety of offences that constitute hate crimes.¹⁹⁰ A general lack of victim support structures for migrant victims of hate crime was in particular reported in Bulgaria, Hungary and Latvia.

In several Member States, there is limited access to legal aid for undocumented migrants in particular. For some Member States (Malta, Finland) access to legal aid provided by the state is dependent on a residence permit and although this is not a legal requirement, it is reported that migrants generally have to show a residence permit when filing such a complaint. In the majority of Member States the important role of NGOs in providing legal support for undocumented migrants, asylum seekers and refugees who are victims of hate crime was emphasised. In **Hungary and Bulgaria**, the Hungarian/Bulgarian Helsinki committee is the main organisation offering legal support to migrants and refugees.¹⁹¹ However, these support structures are not always sufficiently funded and budget cuts were reported in some countries. In the **Czech Republic**, there is hardly any public funding available for civil society organisations providing free legal aid to migrants throughout criminal proceedings, which makes them nearly completely dependent on funds from private donors. In the **United Kingdom**, the budget of the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC), an equality body offering legal advice and support to victims of hate crime, is to be reduced by 25% during the next four years.¹⁹² In **Germany**, civil society organisations criticised the lack of long-term funding, as many are granted government or local authority funding only on a one-year basis.

Language barriers were highlighted in Croatia, the Czech Republic, Hungary and Poland. They reported a lack of available interpreters to facilitate access to (legal) information and procedures as well as a lack of interpretation during criminal proceedings. In **Poland**, the "NEVER AGAIN" association reported the case of an

189 See <http://victimsupport.eu/news/the-eu-victims-directive-on-eu-day-for-victims-of-crime-2016-infringement-cases-opened-against-16-member-states/>

190 European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. *Ensuring Justice for Hate Crime Victims: Professional Perspectives*. 2016. Available at: http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/fra-2016-justice-hate_crime-victims_en.pdf.

191 <http://www.helsinki.hu/en/>.

192 Whitaker, Andrew. 'Cuts to Equality Watchdog Will Harm Hate Crime Victims MP Warns'. *The Herald*. 29 January 2017. Available at: http://www.heraldsotland.com/news/15055566.Cuts_to_equality_watchdog_will_harm_hate_crime_victims_MP_warns/.

Israeli journalist who was a victim of hate crime. He filed a complaint to the police in English and was informed by that the report should be drafted in Polish.¹⁹³

A lack of free psychological help and support and/or a lack of information about organisations offering psychological support were reported in **Croatia, the Czech Republic and Poland**.¹⁹⁴ **Estonia** and **Latvia** cited a general lack of awareness of victims' rights and victim support services among migrants.

In the **Czech Republic**, the project "Safe in your new home" provides access to justice to foreign nationals, migrants and asylum seekers who have been victims of hate crime. The programme aims to increase the target group's awareness of their rights and to assist them with information and counselling.¹⁹⁵ In **Germany**, the refugee council ("Flüchtlingsrat")¹⁹⁶ is active in all 16 federal states of Germany and offers legal support to asylum seekers and refugees. Counselling centres for victims of hate crime such as "Ezra" offer practical and/or legal support to victims of hate crimes, irrespective of the victims' residence status.¹⁹⁷ In **Finland**, the online support service of Victim Support Finland, RIKU.net, provides information translated into 19 languages. RIKU can be contacted anonymously and provides support services regardless of the victims' immigration status.¹⁹⁸ The Latvian Centre for Human Rights is the core NGO addressing the issue of hate crimes, including racist violence in **Latvia**; another NGO "Association of LGBT and their friends Mozaika" has addressed the issue of hate crimes against LGBT people in its work.¹⁹⁹

4.3 Ethnic profiling and criminalisation in the context of counter-terrorism

The framing of migration and asylum issues as a growing security risk for the European Union, a phenomenon

also described as the 'securitisation of migration', has long been observed in research.²⁰⁰ However, with the introduction of new border policies and counter-terrorism and counter-radicalisation measures in some Member States in 2015/2016, ethnic profiling and discriminatory policing of migrants was a significant concern and was reported across EU Member States.

Ethnic profiling and asylum blanket bans

Ethnic profiling refers to the reliance by the police, security, immigration or customs officials on generalisations based on race, ethnicity, religion or national origin - rather than individual behaviour or objective evidence - as the basis for suspicion in directing discretionary law enforcement actions.

The rising number of migrants and asylum seekers led to the re-establishment and/or enhancement of border controls within Europe. Ethnic profiling practices in this context were explicitly reported in Croatia, Estonia, Finland, Greece, Hungary and Italy. However, there are no recent official statistics relating to ethnic profiling across the EU.

A 2014 survey by the EU Fundamental Rights Agency found that 79% of border guards at selected EU airports consider it helpful to use ethnic criteria to detect people who are undocumented.²⁰¹

A web-based mapping project registered nearly 300 reports of ethnic profiling in 10 European countries, following a two-week EU-wide police operation in October 2014 dubbed 'Mos Maiorum', which aimed to detect, detain and deport irregular migrants.²⁰²

The Association for Juridical Studies on Immigration (ASGI) reported cases of ethnic profiling in border areas in **Italy**, such as Brenner on the Austrian border, Como on the Swiss border, and Ventimiglia on the French border

193 Poland Shadow Report questionnaire response.

194 European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. 2017. Available at: <http://fra.europa.eu/en/publication/2016/ensuring-justice-hate-crime-victims-professional-perspectives>

195 <http://en.in-ius.cz/projects/2016/safe-in-your-new-home-ii-the-ministry-of-the-interior-of-the-cr.html>.

196 <http://www.fluechtlingsrat.de/>.

197 <http://www.ezra.de/unsere-aufgabe/>.

198 <http://www.riku.fi/en/in+english/>.

199 <http://cilvektiesibas.org.lv/en/database/report-hate-crime/> and <https://lv.lv.facebook.com/mozaikalv>.

200 Huymans, Jef. 'The European Union and the Securitisation of Migration'. *Journal of Common Market Studies*, Vol. 38, No. 5: 751-77. December 2000. Available at: http://88.255.97.25/reserve/resfall12_13/intl551_Alcdyugu/week9.PDF.

201 <http://fra.europa.eu/en/publication/2014/fundamental-rights-land-borders-findings-selected-european-union-border-crossing>.

202 *Closing Statement: Documenting Racist Controls with Mapping Software*. Available at: <http://map.nadir.org/ushahidi/page/index/8>.

in 2015/16.²⁰³ Field research revealed that border guards specifically asked people of colour for passports or simply ordered them to leave the train under suspicion of moving 'illegally'.²⁰⁴ In **Finland**, police and border guards were observed carrying out spot checks specifically targeting "non-Finnish looking" people in the cities of Helsinki, Espoo and Vantaa in April 2016.²⁰⁵ In **Hungary**, ethnic profiling was reported in Budapest's main train station Keleti in August 2015, where police were observed allowing white people in while stopping people of colour from entering the station.²⁰⁶ The Police Emergency Response Unit in **Cyprus** is reported to carry out stop-and-search targeting migrants, in particular of Asian and African origin, on a regular basis. In some cases these practices involved verbal abuse, ill-treatment and physical violence.²⁰⁷

Civil society organisations have highlighted that in many of these cases people of colour were checked and controlled by the police because they were perceived as undocumented migrants simply because of their 'foreign-looking' appearance, regardless of their actual residence status and/or their nationality.

Apart from ethnic profiling in the context of immigration control, profiling practices based on (perceived) race, ethnicity and religion were reported during routine police contacts on the street or in public places in Austria, Belgium, Cyprus, France, Germany, Italy, Spain and the United Kingdom. A positive development was reported in **France**, where the Cour de Cassation, France's highest

court, for the first time ruled in November 2016 that police illegally checked the identification of three ethnic minority men based on racial profiling.²⁰⁸

Several Member States started profiling arriving asylum seekers on the basis of their nationality and introduced **asylum blanket bans** for some nationalities. In late November 2015, **Slovenia** was the first country to introduce selective entry admissions, allowing only asylum seekers from Syria, Iraq and Afghanistan to enter its territory.²⁰⁹ Within days, **Croatia**, Serbia and the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia introduced similar measures. From February 2016 Afghan nationals and individuals from certain parts of Iraq were also excluded. The underlying rationale for this approach – accepting only asylum seekers from war-torn countries and referring to those from all other countries as 'economic migrants' not needing international protection – was sharply criticised by international organisations. While Amnesty International and the European Council on Refugees and Exiles (ECRE) described these practices as 'discriminatory', the United Nations Refugee Agency UNHCR stressed that "there is (no) nation that can be excluded from international protection".²¹⁰ Assessments regarding the need for international protection were made solely on the basis of (alleged) nationality and without any legal basis.²¹¹ Reports suggest that the nationalities of people without official documents were assessed by police officers and interpreters merely through language, dialect and/or physical features.²¹²

203 ASGI (ed.). *Il diritto di asilo tra accoglienza e esclusione. Nell'ambito del progetto omonimo avente come capofila @uxilia Onlus e realizzato con il contributo di Open Society Foundations*. 2015. Edizioni dell'asino. Available at: <http://www.asgi.it/notizia/asilo-accoglienza-esclusione-ebook/>. As cited in the Italy Shadow Report questionnaire response.

204 Schwarz, Inga. 'Racialising Freedom of Movement in Europe - Experiences of Racial Profiling at European Borders and Beyond'. *Movements Journal*. 2016. Available at: <http://movements-journal.org/issues/03.rassismus/16.schwarz-racializing.freedom.of.movements.in.europe.pdf>.

205 Tessieri, Enrique. 'The Police Spot Check "Foreigners" Friday in Helsinki, Espoo and Vantaa but It's Not Called Ethnic Profiling'. *Migrant Tales*. 2 April 2016. Available at: <http://www.migranttales.net/the-police-spot-check-foreigners-friday-in-helsinki-espoo-and-vantaa-but-its-not-called-ethnic-profiling/> and Osazee, Uyi. 'The Reality of Ethnic and Racial Profiling in Finland'. *Migrant Tales*. 27 June 2016. Available at: <http://www.migranttales.net/uyi-osazee-the-reality-of-ethnic-and-racial-profiling-in-finland/>. As cited in the Finland Shadow Report questionnaire response.

206 Faiola, Anthony and Birnbaum, Michael. 'Migrants' Deaths Bring Scrutiny to European Handling of Refugees'. *Washington Post*. 30 August 2015. Available at: https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/in-migrant-deaths-critics-also-blame-europe/2015/08/30/5b01c89a-4dd4-11e5-80c2-106ea7fb80d4_story.html?utm_term=.1b7b82d83e11.

207 Cyprus Shadow Report questionnaire response.

208 'Top French Court: Police Illegally Checked 3 Minority Men'. *Business Standard*. 9 November 2016. Available at: http://www.business-standard.com/article/pti-stories/top-french-court-police-illegally-checked-3-minority-men-116110901623_1.html.

209 Ihring, Diana. 'Selective Border Policies and Victimhood: The Shrinking Protection Space for Migrants in Europe'. *Oxford Monitor of Forced Migration Vol. 6, No. 1*. 2016. Available at: <http://oxmofm.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/DIANA-IHRING.pdf>.

210 Gardos, Todor. *Barring Refugees from Balkans is Discriminatory*. Amnesty International. 1 December 2015. Available at: <https://www.amnesty.org.nz/barring-refugees-balkans-discriminatory>.

211 European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. *Weekly Data Collection on the Situation of Persons in Need of International Protection - Update # 8 16 November–20 November 2015*. 2015. Available at: http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/fra-2015-weekly-compilation-8_en.pdf.

212 European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights. *Monthly Data Collection on the Current Migration Situation in the EU - April 2016 Monthly Report 1–31 March 2016*. 2016. Available at: http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/fra-2016-monthly-compilation-com-update-4-0_en.pdf.

Discrimination on grounds of nationality has also been reported in Greece's and Italy's hotspots.²¹³ In **Greece**, Syrians have been prioritised over all other nationalities in registration, identification and access to asylum.²¹⁴ Civil society organisations in **Italy** observed that certain African nationalities, e.g. Nigerians, are systematically prevented from formally claiming asylum, and instead are directly issued a formal 'refusal' order.²¹⁵

Discriminatory policing in the context of counter-terrorism

After the 2015/16 terrorist attacks in Europe several EU Member States, amongst others Belgium, France, Hungary, Poland and the United Kingdom, introduced new counter-terrorism measures and counter-radicalisation policies with a disproportionate negative impact on foreign nationals and ethnic/religious minorities.²¹⁶ The impact, in particular on the Muslim population as whole, was reported and documented by several organisations. However, these policies were also used to target in particular Muslim refugees and migrants (or those perceived as such). A broad definition of what constitutes terrorism or terrorist acts as well as enhanced executive powers under emergency laws and a weakening of judicial controls left plenty of space for misuse and unequal treatment.²¹⁷

In **Hungary**, a Syrian national who lived in Cyprus for 10 years and had an EU residency permit, was sentenced to 10 years imprisonment by a Hungarian court in November 2016 for throwing stones at the police in an attempt to push through the border, which was considered as an "act of terror". Initially, he had travelled to Hungary from Syria with his parents to help them on their journey to Europe.²¹⁸ This case is a clear example of how these policies can be used to criminalise migrants and refugees.

In **Poland**, a new counter-terrorism law was introduced in June 2016 under which foreign nationals can be subjected to a range of covert surveillance measures, including wire-tapping, monitoring of electronic communications, and surveillance of telecommunications networks and devices for up to three months, with no requirement of prior judicial authorisation, or a reasonable suspicion of wrongdoing. The new law was also criticised for its broad definition of terrorism and its inherent focus on Muslim migrants. An earlier draft of the law from May 2016 intended to categorise "plans to establish Islamic universities" or visits of Muslim clerics to prisons as terrorist incidents.²¹⁹

In addition, civil society organisations across Europe reported the development of an overall climate of suspicion against Muslim migrants or those perceived as such. In Austria, Belgium, France, Spain and the United Kingdom, foreign nationals and Muslim migrants are increasingly reported to the police or checked by the police due alleged 'suspicious behaviour' or suspicion of radicalisation. In **Belgium**, an Iranian PhD student at Ghent University was identified as "behaving suspiciously" by the Brussels police and kept under gunpoint for four hours in July 2016. He was forced to strip to his underwear and to lie on the street, and was kept in prison for one night. The student was released after it became clear that he was measuring radiation on the streets as part of his PhD research. After the incident, he suffered from post-traumatic stress and needed psychological assistance. The police blamed him for his "bad will and abnormal behaviour".²²⁰ In the **United Kingdom**, an Iraqi born student was reported by another flight passenger to the police because he wrote a text message in Arabic on his way from Vienna to London Gatwick in March 2016. He was asked to leave the plane and held for four hours. Police confiscated his phone and he was left at the airport without a new ticket or refund.²²¹

213 Papadopoulou, Aspasia. *The Implementation of the Hotspots in Italy and Greece*. 2016. Available at: <http://www.ecre.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/12/HOTSPOTS-Report-5.12.2016.pdf>

214 Domokos, John and Kingsley, Patrick. 'Chaos on Greek Islands as Refugee Registration System Favours Syrians' *The Guardian*. 21 November 2015. Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/nov/21/chaos-greek-islands-three-tier-refugee-registration-system-syria-lesbos>.

215 ASGI. *Il Diritto Negato: dalle Stragi in Mare agli Hotspot*. 2016. Available at: http://www.asgi.it/wp-content/uploads/2016/01/2016_asilo_puglia_11.pdf. As cited in the Italy Shadow Report questionnaire response.

216 Amnesty International. *Europe: Dangerously disproportionate: The Ever-Expanding National Security State in Europe*. 2017. Available at: <https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/eur01/5342/2017/en/>.

217 Ibid.

218 Kingsley, Patrick. 'Amnesty Condemns Jailing of Syrian on Terror Charges in Hungary' *The Guardian*. 30 November 2016. Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/nov/30/amnesty-condemns-jailing-syrian-terror-charges-in-hungary-ahmed-h>.

219 Amnesty International. *Poland Submission to the United Nations Human Rights Committee 118th Session*. November 2016. Available at: <https://amnesty.org.pl/wp-content/uploads/2016/10/HRC-submission-Amnesty-International.pdf>.

220 <http://newsmonkey.be/article/71548> as cited in the Belgium Shadow Report questionnaire response.

221 Khaleeli, Homa. 'The Perils of "Flying while Muslim"'. *The Guardian*. 8 August 2016. Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/aug/08/the-perils-of-flying-while-muslim>.